Constructing 'Orthodoxy', Creating Identity. The Sermons of Master Alan of Lille (d. 1202/03)[1]

Anne Greule

Abstract

This paper suggests a fresh look at the sermons of Alan of Lille, who taught arts and theology in Paris in the second half of the 12th century. It takes two concepts as a starting point: Firstly, Clare Monagle's thesis of the "Scholastic Project", which highlights the socially exclusive effects of scholasticism; secondly, the concept of "blurred boundaries" between 'orthodoxy' and 'heresy' that helps to emphasize the fluid character of 'orthodoxy'. Rather than being a homogenous entity, it is equally as instable as 'heterodoxy', and subject to the interests of its proponents. This is of particular importance for the period considered here, when Paris masters had not yet acquired the status of theological experts that later university masters would have. Against this background, this paper argues that Alan did not only disseminate theological doctrine, but at the same time contributed to his self-fashioning as an orthodox theologian in a time of transition at the Paris schools. It becomes clear how the promotion of 'orthodoxy' is linked to social and personal circumstances.

Keywords: Alan of Lille, 12th-century schools, Paris, sermons, orthodoxy

Introduction

In 2017, a short, but thought-provoking book appeared: Clare Monagle's *The Scholastic Project*.[2] Medieval scholasticism, she argues, should not only be seen as a method that is based on free inquiry and opens up the way to intellectual diversity. By treating scholasticism as a project similar to the Enlightenment, Monagle wants to shift the focus to its less bright aspects. She writes: "It was a project, in as much as the Enlightenment can be conceived as such, one that depended upon a shared idea of reason as a means of coming to know the world, as well as a way of building knowledge in the world."[3] This intellectual approach was intended to ensure orthodoxy. Reason had to constitute 'correct' doctrine, to spread this doctrine, and to fight deviant approaches. Thereby, the scholastic project did not only exclude those persons seen as irrational, such as women, but also constructed clear lines between the orthodox and the heretic.[4] "To do theology was to produce the boundaries around licit and illicit God-talk",[5] Monagle writes. The synthesizing works of Peter Lombard and Thomas Aquinas, the *Sentences* and the *Summa Theologica*, serve as

---

[2] Clare Monagle, *The Scholastic Project,* Past imperfect series (Kalamazoo: Arc Humanities Press, 2017).
[3] Monagle, *The Scholastic Project*, 8.
[4] Monagle, *The Scholastic Project*, 9.
[5] Monagle, *The Scholastic Project*, 43.

her most important examples for this process of definition. The project, however, did not remain in the spheres of mere intellectual speculation. In the person of Innocent III, a Paris-trained theologian and canonist, the scholastic project merged with papal claims of power, as the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215 clearly shows. "The persecuting society and the scholastic project, at least at this moment, were moving together",[6] Monagle states, echoing Robert Ian Moore[7].

Monagle's shift of perspective on scholasticism is highly important for questions pertaining to the blurred boundaries of religious dissent.[8] Instead of (re-)telling the success story of continuous rationalisation with the Paris schools of the 12th century as its focal point, as it has long been the case,[9] we are encouraged to conceive of them in terms of hegemony and exclusion. Scholasticism, accordingly, tries to establish a boundary between orthodoxy and heterodoxy, with the Paris schoolmasters as the guardians of the former. At the same time, conceiving of the boundaries between orthodoxy and heterodoxy as blurred helps us to adopt a nuanced view on orthodoxy. Rather than being a monolithic, homogenous entity, it is equally instable as heterodoxy and subject to the interests of its proponents. It is, firstly, this perspective that we should adopt, and ask how various agents in the school milieu contributed to a concept they conceived of as orthodoxy.

Secondly, Monagle's approach can be further developed towards a more detailed look at the different stages of the schools' historical situation.[10] It makes a huge difference if we, as in Monagle's examples, focus on a figure like Peter Lombard in the years around 1140 to 1160, schoolmaster at the Paris cathedral school and later bishop, or on Thomas Aquinas, lecturing at the university of Paris from ca 1250 onwards. Interests and perspectives differ according to the institutions and their respective development and standing.

Therefore, I ask how the Paris masters contributed to the construction of orthodoxy in a specific historical situation in the history of the schools. Thereby, utterances which otherwise would not attract attention can become meaningful. As an example, I shift the focus to a thinker who, chronologically, stands between the Lombard

[6] Monagle, *The Scholastic Project*, 49.

[7] Robert I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Authority and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250* (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, ²2007).

[8] Cf. Delfi I. Nieto-Isabel, "*Introduction. All but Marginal: The Co-Constructions of Otherness in the Middle Ages.*" In *Living on the Edge. Transgression, Exclusion, and Persecution in the Middle Ages*, eds. Delfi I. Nieto-Isabel and Laura Miquel Milian (Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter, 2022), 3–19; Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane and Anne Elisabeth Lester, "*Introduction: Religion and Religious Worlds in Between.*" In *Between Orders and Heresy: Rethinking Medieval Religious Movements*, eds. Jennifer K. Deane and Anne E. Lester (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2022), 3–22.

[9] For such a view, see, e.g., the otherwise outstanding studies of Hastings Rashdall, *The Universities of Europe in the Middle Ages*: *Vol. 1*, eds. Frederick M. Powicke and Alfred B. Emden (Oxford: Univ. Press, 1936); Peter Weimar, ed., *Die Renaissance der Wissenschaften im 12. Jahrhundert,* Zürcher Hochschulforum 2 (Zürich: Artemis-Verlag, 1981); Robert L. Benson, Giles Constable and Carol D. Lanham, eds., *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982); Peter Dinzelbacher, *Structures and Origins of the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance"*, Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters 63 (Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2017).

[10] For the history of the 12th-century schools cf. Cédric Giraud, ed., *A Companion to Twelfth-Century Schools,* Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition 88 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2020). For Paris, see Nathalie Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université: Les écoles de Paris d'Innocent III à Thomas d'Aquin (v. 1200–v. 1245)*, Études d'histoire médiévale 14 (Paris: Champion, 2012); Stephen C. Ferruolo, *The Origins of the University: The Schools of Paris and Their Critics, 1100–1215* (Stanford, Calif.: Univ. Press, 1985).

and Aquinas: Alan of Lille. The master Alan of Lille was active during that time when the Paris schools gradually transformed into the University of Paris. Their masters had not yet acquired the status of experts in theological matters.[11] Thus, how did Alan contribute to the "Scholastic Project" as regards the construction of orthodoxy? How did his insecure status influence his thinking, or, to be more precise, the textual representation of his thinking?[12] To tackle these questions, I want to concentrate on a different type of text: sermons to students and masters. The masters developed their thoughts not only in (later to become) authoritative *summae*, but also by disputing and preaching.[13] Orthodoxy was thus constructed by various means.[14]

In the following, I describe the development of the Paris schools in the 12th century to make it clearer that the masters' expert status was far from safe. I will continue with a quick overview of Alan's biography and his homiletic works before turning to the analysis of his sermons. I will try to interpret my findings against Monagle's thesis of the "Scholastic Project". The masters of Paris in Alan's time had not yet acquired the status of experts of theology, they still had to defend their status as teachers and creators of religious doctrine. The sermons of Alan of Lille, I argue, testify to the masters' efforts to present themselves as representatives of orthodoxy which, at the same time, helped creating cohesion among the scholars and students.

The Schools of Paris in the Twelfth Century

In Alan's time, the landscape of Christian schools in Paris included the various monastic and collegiate schools, for example at St. Denis or St. Victor, as well as the cathedral school of Notre-Dame.[15] In addition, there was a growing number of *scholae*, each run by individual masters. The "croissance anarchique"[16] of these schools, as Jacques Verger calls it, cannot be substantiated numerically, but historiographical sources in particular give the impression of a steady

---

[11] See Sita Steckel, *Kulturen des Lehrens im Früh- und Hochmittelalter: Autorität, Wissenskonzepte und Netzwerke von Gelehrten,* Norm und Struktur 39 (Köln: Böhlau, 2011). For the research concept of 'experts' in the Middle ages c.f. Frank Rexroth and Teresa Schröder-Stapper, eds., *Experten, Wissen, Symbole: Performanz und Medialität vormoderner Wissenskulturen,* Historische Zeitschrift. Beiheft 71 (Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter, 2018).

[12] Only recently, scholars have paid more attention to the socio-cultural circumstances of the Paris schools, see Frank Rexroth, *Fröhliche Scholastik: Die Wissenschaftsrevolution des Mittelalters* (München: C.H.Beck, 2018). The book was translated into English: Frank Rexroth, *Knowledge True and Useful: A Cultural History of Early Scholasticism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2023).

[13] For the teaching practices in the 12th century schools, see e.g. Francesco Siri, "*Lectio, disputatio, reportatio*: Note su alcune pratiche didattiche nel XII secolo e sulla loro trasmissione," In *Medioevo e filosofia: Per Alfonso Maierù*, eds. Massimiliano Lenzi, Cesare A. Musatti and Luisa Valente, I libri di Viella 150 (Rom: Viella, 2013) 109–28; Olga Weijers, *A Scholar's Paradise: Teaching and Debating in Medieval Paris,* Studies on the Faculty of Arts 2 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2015).

[14] We must keep in mind that we never have access to the sermon as it was delivered; the oral event is lost forever. For this paper, however, the question of the actual delivery is of less importance. If a specific sermon had been disseminated only in written form, it still would have contributed to the formation of belief. See the contributions in Carolyn Muessig, ed., *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages,* A New History of the Sermon 3 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2002).

[15] Cf. e.g. Jacques Verger, "Des écoles à l'université: La mutation institutionnelle," In *La France de Philippe Auguste*, ed. Robert-Henri Bautier, Colloques internationaux du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique 602 (Paris, 1982), 817-46.

[16] Jacques Verger, "A propos de la naissance de l'université de Paris: Contexte social, enjeu politique, portée intellectuelle," In *Schulen und Studium im sozialen Wandel des hohen und späten Mittelalters*, ed. Johannes Fried, Vorträge und Forschungen 30 (Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1986), 81.

growth in students and schools. Around 1200, students probably had a choice between a total of about thirty to forty theology masters and at least fifty, if not twice as many, *artes* masters.[17] From this period onwards, there is also increasing evidence of collaborative action by the masters, or at least by some of them. This included the drafting of statutes and, as early as 1221, the use of a common seal.[18] The growth seems to have created a need for regulation, which eventually led to the creation of the University of Paris.[19]

The following should be given more consideration in research: It made a difference whether one was a master at the cathedral school of Notre-Dame, in the abbey of St. Victor, or one of the 'free' masters who settled mainly on the left bank of the Seine. Notre-Dame's school was headed by the chancellor, who transferred the teaching obligations to a master. Canons of the cathedral equally taught considerable numbers of students, which continuously prompted the bishops to prohibit lending the cloister's houses to external students.[20] The abbey of St. Victor was, in the first half of the 12th century, a distinguished place of learning for both its members and a small number of individual students who, as Peter Lombard did, used their networks to get access to the abbey's teaching.[21] In the second half of the century, the abbey and its school partly lost their previous importance, starting with the financial mismanagement of the abbot, Ernis (1162–1172),[22] and continuing with the attacks against schoolmen by the prior Walter (1173–ca 1180).[23] Compared to the 'free' schools, both the cathedral

---

[17] See John W. Baldwin, "Masters at Paris from 1179 to 1215: A Social Perspective," In *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, eds. Robert L. Benson, Giles Constable and Carol D. Lanham (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982), 138–72, and Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université*, pp. 71, 91, 132–33.

[18] Cf. Jacques Verger, "Que sait-on des institutions universitaires parisiennes avant 1245?," In *Les débuts de l'enseignement universitaire à Paris (1200–1245 environ)*, eds. Jacques Verger and Olga Weijers, Studia artistarum 38 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013), 27-47; Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université*, 354–60.

[19] Cf. Frank Rexroth, "Reformen gegen den Eigensinn: Die Pariser Statuten 1215 und der Konservatismus der frühen Universitätsgeschichte," In *Universität - Reform: Ein Spannungsverhältnis von langer Dauer (12.–21. Jahrhundert)*, ed. Stefan Hynek et al., Veröffentlichungen der Gesellschaft für Universitäts- und Wissenschaftsgeschichte 14 (Basel: Schwabe Verlag Basel, 2018), 23-50. See also Ian P. Wei, *Intellectual Culture in Medieval Paris*: *Theologians and the University, c. 1100–1330* (Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012), 86–101, who interprets the regulations as a response to monastic criticism and equally highlights the schools' and the early university's fragile status.

[20] See Thierry Kouamé, "L'école cathédrale," In *Notre-Dame de Paris. Une cathédrale dans la ville. Des origines à nos jours*, eds. Boris Bove and Claude Gauvard (Paris: Belin, 2022), 163–87, especially the helpful chart on pp. 186–87, which shows the masters and their different offices; Astrik Ladislas Gabriel, "The Cathedral Schools of Notre-Dame and the Beginning of the University of Paris," In *Garlandia. Studies in the History of the Mediaeval University* (Notre Dame, Ind.: The Mediaeval Inst., Univ. of Notre Dame; Frankfurt a.M.: Knecht, 1969), 39–64.

[21] Cf. Cédric Giraud, "L'école de Saint-Victor dans la première moitié du XIIe siècle, entre école monastique et école cathédrale," In *L'école de Saint-Victor de Paris. Influence et rayonnement*, ed. Dominique Poirel, Bibliotheca victorina 22 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2010), 101–19; Matthew Doyle, *Peter Lombard and his Students*, Studies and Texts 201 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2016), pp. 26–33.

[22] Cf. Marshall E. Crossnoe, "The Regular Canons of Saint-Victor in the World of Louis VII," In *Louis VII and His World*, ed. Michael L. Bardot and Laurence W. Marvin, Later Medieval Europe 18 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2018), 126–45, 142–43; Rolf Große "Entre cour et cloître: Saint-Victor et les Capétiens au XIIe siècle," In *L'École de Saint-Victor de Paris. Influence et rayonnement*, ed. Dominique Poirel, Bibliotheca victorina 22 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2010), 79–100, 95–99.

[23] See below and cf. Helmut G. Walther, "St. Victor und die Schulen von Paris vor der Entstehung der Universität," In *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter. Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Martin Kintzinger, Archiv für Kulturgeschichte. Beihefte 42 (Köln: Böhlau, 1996), 53–74, 69–72; Palémon Glorieux, "Le

school and the teaching at St. Victor offered more stability and regularity to (mostly internal) students and masters.

These 'free' schools, finally, run by independent masters, settled around the cathedral, on the Petit-Pont, and on the left bank of the river Seine.[24] The students had the possibility to regularly change their masters, which limited the control over them. The 13th century statutes prescribing that students must be assigned to one master who holds judgement over them can be interpreted as an effort to gain control over them.[25] The masters of the free schools were not protected by a local community, were not part of the parish community, and their works had poorer chances of being transmitted due to the lack of corresponding institutions. They were also in greater competition for paying students, as they often lacked a prebend as a source of income.[26]

Although the masters of the second half of the 12th century were no longer a new phenomenon in Paris, they still were in a precarious situation. Even the cathedral master Peter of Poitiers could, at the very beginning of his career, not rely on an already acquired expert status,[27] but felt the need to receive the approvement of the powerful archbishop of Sens (1168/69–1176), William of Champagne, for his *Sentences*[28] – a gesture that could at the same time hint to Peter's further career ambitions. In 1179/80, Peter's theological work fell victim to the attacks of Walter of St. Victor, who saw in Peter, together with Abaelard, Gilbert of Poitiers and Peter Lombard, a threat to orthodox theology.[29] Some passages were also directed against Godfrey of St. Victor.[30] The influence of the work is not clear, but the fact that the prior of St. Victor published such a polemical work should be taken serious as an attack against Peter's theological method. It equally reflects the insecure status of the Lombard's *Sentences*, which only gradually acquired the status of the standard theological reference work.[31]

Alan of Lille, for his part, felt the need to ask high-ranking church authorities for the correction of his writings, and to put himself under

---

'Contra quatuor labyrinthos Franciae' de Gauthier de Saint-Victor," In *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Âge* 19, 1952, 187–335.

[24] Cf. Ferruolo, *Origins*, pp. 11–25.

[25] See Rexroth, "Reformen", 46; Rexroth, *Fröhliche Scholastik*, p. 324. Ferruolo, *Origins*, pp. 17–24.

[26] See Jacques Verger, "De l'école d'Abélard aux premières universités," In *Pierre Abélard: Colloque international de Nantes*, eds. Jean Jolivet and Henri Habrias, Collection "Histoire" (Rennes: Presses Universitaires, 2003), 17-28; Rexroth, "Reformen," 42–46. In the case of the theology masters, it is at least possible that they had a prebend in their home region, see Baldwin, "Masters at Paris", 158–60.

[27] On Peter, see John W. Baldwin, *Masters, Princes and Merchants*: *The Social Views of Peter the Chanter and His Circle, Vol. 1* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press, 1970), p. 44; Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université*, p. 54-55.

[28] William was the brother-in-law of king Louis VII, through the latter's marriage to Adela of Champagne, cf. John D. Hosler, "The War Councils and Military Advisers of Louis VII of France," In *Louis VII and His World*, ed. Michael L. Bardot and Laurence W. Marvin, Later Medieval Europe 18 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2018), 11–28, 22. For the dedication of the "Sentences" to William, see Petrus Pictaviensis, *Sententiae*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 211 (Paris, 1855), col. 790.

[29] Glorieux, "Le 'Contra quatuor labyrinthos Franciae'".

[30] Godfrey of St. Victor, *Le Microcosme (L'œuvre de Godefroid de Saint-Victor, vol. 1)*, ed. Françoise Gasparri, Sous la Règle de Saint Augustin, 16 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2020), 23–25.

[31] Cf. on this topic Clare Monagle, *Orthodoxy and Controversy in Twelfth-Century Religious Discourse. Peter Lombard's 'Sentences' and the Development of Theology*, Europa sacra 8 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013).

their patronage.[32] He dedicated his distinction collection to Ermengaud, abbot of St. Giles (1179–1203) in the diocese of Nîmes.[33] In the dedicatory lines, he expresses the hope that Ermengaud's reputation will protect the work, and that his learning will ensure its conformity with orthodox doctrine.[34] Alan's *Liber Poenitentialis* contains a dedication to the archbishop of Bourges (1983–1199/1200), Henry of Sully, in which Alan assures Henry of the work's consonance with the Scriptures, and – as he does in the distinction collection – humbly speaks of himself as "dictus magister".[35] Henry was not only the cousin of the mentioned William of Champagne, but also of Adele of Champagne, queen and mother of Philip August.[36] As in the case of Peter of Poitiers, the dedications serve as a means of protection against potential accusations of theological inadequacy. Moreover, they can be read as attempts to find new career options with the help of powerful patrons, in a time when Alan was about to (or already had) quit his teaching in Paris and was heading to the south.

Alan of Lille as a 12th-century master

Alan of Lille is usually seen as a representative of the older schooling system of the Cathedral schools, an old man decrying the changes that took place in the Paris schools.[37] However, there are strong reasons to assume that he was born later, probably around 1140. He was a master in his thirties, active in the schools in a period

---

[32] This is how I interpret Alan's dedications of works to ecclesiastical authorities, see Anne Greule, "Prediger der Transformation: Alain von Lille und die Pariser Schulen in der zweiten Hälfte des 12. Jahrhunderts" (Dissertation: Jena, 2022), forthcoming (Pariser Historische Studien). For Alan's dedications (partly), see Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille: Textes inédits, avec une introduction sur sa vie et ses œuvres,* Études de philosophie médiévale 52 (Paris: Vrin, 1965), 13–17. Concerning the topical request for correction, see Steckel, *Kulturen des Lehrens,* 673–76.

[33] On Ermengaud, see Ulrich Winzer, *S. Gilles. Studien zum Rechtsstatus und Beziehungsnetz einer Abtei im Spiegel ihrer Memorialüberlieferung,* Münstersche Mittelalter-Schriften 59 (München: Fink, 1988), pp. 248–52.

[34] Alanus ab Insulis, Distinctiones Dictionum Theologicalium, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 211 (Paris, 1855), coll. 685–86: *Reverendissimo Patri et domino Hermengaldo, Dei gratia Sancti Aegidii abbati, Alanus dictus magister [...]. Tali igitur sideri mei operis sidus devoveo, divinis stellarum sententiis theologicarum auctoritatum praeditum munimentis; et sicut tuo titulatur sub nomine, ita tuo insigniatur munimine, quatenus tui libra judicii mei libri libret sententias, ut si aliquid minus fuerit igne rationis decoctum, sepeliatur silentio; quod vero videbitur in fabrica prudentie expolitum, celebretur in publico. Non enim volo ut opus meum prius in aures publicas exeat divulgatum quam a statera tuae examinationis exierit trutinatum, ut vel valeat tuae prudentiae judicio comprobatum, vel vileat tuae auctoritatis sententia reprobatum.* – "To the most reverend father and lord Ermengaud, by the grace of God abbot of Saint Giles, Alanus, called 'master' [...]. Therefore, I dedicate to such a star the star of my work, fortified with the divine sentences of the stars of the theological authorities; and as it is named under your name, so may it be under your protection, so that the balance of your judgment weighs the sentences of my book, so that if anything has not been boiled enough by the fire of reason, it is buried in silence; what seems to be polished in the workshop of prudence, is celebrated in public. For I do not wish my work to go out divulged to the public ears before it has come out weighed from the balance of your examination, that it may either be approved according to the judgment of your prudence, or rejected according to the sentence of your authority."

[35] Alanus ab Insulis, *Liber Poenitentialis: Vol. 2: La tradition longue, texte inédit,* ed. Jean Longère, Analecta mediaevalia Namurcensia 18 (Louvain - Lille: Éditions Nauwelaerts, 1965), prologus, pp. 17–18: *Henrico Dei gratia Bituricensi patriarchae, Aquitanorum primati, Alanus dictus Magister opus suum. [...] Hoc autem opusculum ita Sacrae Scripturae consonum esse videtur, ut non nostrum inventum sed furtum esse credatur.*

[36] See John W. Baldwin, *The Government of Philip Augustus: Foundations of French Royal Power in the Middle Ages* (Berkeley, Calif.: Univ. of California Press, 1986), pp. 50, 67, 437.

[37] Paradigmatically Charles S. Jaeger, "Pessimism in the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance"," In *Speculum* 78, no. 4 (2003), 1151-83.

of transformation. Probably from 1160 to around 1185, he lectured, held disputations, and preached in Paris as an independent master of the liberal arts and of theology.[38] Furthermore, he composed manuals for preaching and confession as well as commentaries on the *Our Father* and the *Credo*.[39] These works were intended to provide preachers and confessors with orthodox material and to enhance the quality of pastoral care. Activities of this kind have long been associated with the so-called "circle of Peter the Chanter", investigated by John Baldwin. For him, Alan belonged to the scholars in the tradition of Gilbert of Poitiers, opposed to the Chanter's orientation, and allegedly marked by their purely intellectual theological interests.[40] However, Alan's manuals and commentaries show that this characterisation is one-sided, and this further adds to recent criticism of Baldwin's typology.[41] Thus, Alan must not only be seen as a younger representative of the Paris schools of the 12th century, but also as an active intellectual, promoting orthodoxy and pastoral care.

Around 1185, Alan went to Southern France where he seems to have enjoyed high esteem in the entourage of William VIII of Montpellier. It is likely that he wrote his apologetic treatise against Valdensians, 'heretics', Muslims, and Jews at that time.[42] Shortly before his death in 1202/03, he went to the Cistercian monastery of Cîteaux, where he was buried. This is why some researchers imagine Alan as part of Cistercian preaching campaigns, directly confronting the Southern Cathars.[43]

From my studies in Alan's sermons, my view is a different one. Based on the general difficulty of the content and the rhetorical elements as well as the manuscript rubrics, direct addresses like "vos

---

[38] For this thesis and the following, see Greule, "Prediger der Transformation". The earlier years of birth, ranging from 1115 to 1128, are pure conjectures or stem from Alan's confusion with Alan of Auxerre. As his year of death in 1202 or 1203 is rather safely reported by Alberic of Troisfontaines, and Alan's period of work most likely started in the 1170s, it seems more reasonable to assume a later year of birth. For the best biography so far see d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 11–29. In his introduction to Alan's penitential manual, Jean Longère already suggested to place Alan's year of birth after 1130, see Alanus ab Insulis, *Liber Poenitentialis*: *Vol. 1: Introduction doctrinale et littéraire*, ed. Jean Longère, Analecta mediaevalia Namurcensia 17 (Louvain, Lille: Éditions Nauwelaerts, 1965), 21.

[39] D'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 79–85, 109–19, 152–54.

[40] Baldwin, *Masters, Princes and Merchants*, pp. 43–46. In this sense also Nicole Bériou, *L'avènement des maîtres de la parole*: *La prédication à Paris au* XIIIe *siècle. Vol. 1,* Collection des études Augustiniennes. Moyen âge et temps modernes 31 (Paris: Inst. d'Études Augustiennes, 1998), 30–45, esp. 43. Baldwin's dichotomy of "theoretical" and "practical" theologians, which goes back to Martin Grabmann, is still influential to the interpretations of Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université* concerning the development of the University of Paris.

[41] Cf. Alexander Andrée, "*Sacra Pagina*: Theology and the Bible from the School of Laon to the School of Paris," In *A Companion to Twelfth-Century Schools*, ed. Cédric Giraud, Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition 88 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2020), 272-314; Mark J. Clark, "Peter Lombard, Stephen Langton, and the School of Paris: The Making of the Twelfth-Century Scholastic Biblical Tradition," In *Traditio* 72 (Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2017), 171–274.

[42] Cf. Joseph H. Pearson, "The Anti-Jewish Polemic of Alan of Lille," In *Alain de Lille, le Docteur Universel: Philosophie, théologie et littérature au* XIIe *siècle*, eds. Jean-Luc Solère, Anca Vasiliu and Alain Galonnier, Rencontres de philosophie médiévale 12 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2005), 83-106.

[43] John M. Trout, "Alan the Missionary," In *Cîteaux* 26, no. 3 (1975), 146-54; Guy Raynaud de Lage, *Alain de Lille*: *Poète du* XIIe *siècle* (Montreal, Paris: Institut d'Études Médiévales, 1951). Kienzle highlights more Alan's intellectual contributions to manuals of pastoral care and to the apologetic genre, see Beverly Mayne Kienzle, *Cistercians, Heresy and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229*: *Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard* (York: York Medieval Press, 2001), 172–73.

claustrales" or references to specific living conditions, I conclude that his main audience students and masters, clerics, and cloistered men.[44] There is no indication that Alan preached directly to 'heretics' or persons with a non-academic or non-clerical background. It is possible that they formed part of the audience, but Alan's main target group were his fellow scholars and religious groups.[45] This is why I also consider his apologetic treatise against the heretics as a scholastic product.[46] In contrast to Hilbert Chiu, I do not assume that Alan builds 'the heretic' as a mere straw man against whom he can direct his arguments about orthodoxy.[47] I rather think that he had encountered some ideas considered heretical, be it in Paris or in the French South, which he wanted to refute. But his target group as listeners or readers were students of theology and clerics which he provided with doctrine and arguments, as he did in his sermons.[48]

Emmanuel Bain's study on Alan's treatise makes this even clearer: He convincingly argues that Alan and William VIII of Montpellier joined forces to their respective advantage: Alan, as a scholar in a precarious situation, was in need of a patron. The lord of Montpellier, who is well known for his support of the town's medical schools, welcomed the theologian who could be useful for his own cause. In order to obtain the legitimization of his son William from pope Innocent III, he was eager to represent himself as the most prominent fighter for orthodoxy. Thus, he did not only ask for a legate for this mission, but also included a Paris-trained theologian in his entourage.[49] Bain further highlights the fact that Alan's work was not meant to refute a particular heresy. Although it contains a book specifically against the Valdensians, its overall impetus is to provide a general defence of Catholic beliefs against the spectre of a universal heresy with the means of an intellectual: providing rational arguments and authorities against alleged claims of deviant groups. Self-confidently, he offers an orthodox *summa* to be used against all kinds of heretical arguments.[50]

---

[44] Analyzed in Greule, "Prediger der Transformation". For Alan's preaching and a first listing of his sermons see also d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 109–48. Editions of sermons are provided ibid. 237–287. Among the publications of Jean Longère, cf. e.g. Jean Longère, "Alain de Lille, prédicateur," In *Les Sermons au temps de la Renaissance*, ed. Marie T. Jones-Davies, Université de Paris-Sorbonne, Société Internationale de Recherches Interdisciplinaires sur la Renaissance, SIRIR 24 (Paris: Klincksieck, 1999), 125-42.

[45] For the efforts of the Parisian masters to expand and enhance preaching see Bériou, *L'avènement des maîtres, Vol. 1*; Baldwin, *Masters, Princes and Merchants, Vol. 1*; Jessalynn L. Bird, "The Construction of Orthodoxy and the (De)Construction of Heretical Attacks on the Eucharist in Pastoralia from Peter the Chanter's Circle in Paris," In *Texts and the Repression of Medieval Heresy*, eds. Caterina Bruschi and Peter Biller, York Studies in Medieval Theology 4 (Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2003), 45-61.

[46] Alanus ab Insulis, *De Fide Catholica Contra Haereticos*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210 (Paris, 1855). Häring lists 35 manuscripts with the treatise, see Nikolaus M. Häring, "Alan of Lille's De Fide Catholica or Contra Haereticos," In *Analecta Cisterciensia* 32, 1976, 216-37.

[47] Hilbert Chiu, "Alan of Lille's Academic Concept of the Manichee," *Journal of Religious History* 35, no. 4 (2011), 492-506.

[48] Peter Biller concludes from the anti-heretical tracts by Alan and Alexander Neckam that there could have been Cathars in the Paris region. See Peter Biller, "Northern Cathars and Higher Learning," In *The Medieval Church: Universities, Heresy, and the Religious Life. Essays in Honour of Gordon Leff*, ed. Peter Biller and Richard B. Dobson, Studies in Church History. Subsidia 11 (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1999), 25-53.

[49] Emmanuel Bain, "Les hérétiques du prince: Alain de Lille et les hérétiques méridionaux," In *Le »Catharisme« en questions*, ed. Jean-Louis Biget, Cahiers de Fanjeaux 55 (Fanjeaux, 2020), 180–82.

[50] Bain, "Les hérétiques du prince," 174–88. Cf. also Alanus ab Insulis, *De Fide Catholica Contra Haereticos*, prologus, col. 307–8.

Preaching to the choir: Alan of Lille's 'orthodox' sermons

Alan's preaching served the cause of magisterial self-fashioning as promoters of 'orthodoxy' as well. Drawing on Jessalynn Bird, who stressed the role of Parisian masters in the construction of orthodoxy via preaching,[51] I will distinguish two methods of communicating orthodox belief: On the level of religious content, the masters tried to teach essential theological doctrines to wider audiences, thereby adopting different techniques of communication. Furthermore, they promoted self-inquiry and penance as a means of religious control. I will show that we can find both of these elements in Alan's sermons, although "wider audiences" in his case means: fellow schoolmen, as potential future prelates.

I chose a collection of Marian and Lenten sermons as examples. Marian sermons, on the one hand, are particularly interesting, because they show us how the Paris masters dealt with new dogmatic theories on the mother of God. Lenten sermons, on the other hand, are intended to prepare the audience for penance and thus are more likely to contain statements on self-inquiry. Their specific exhortations will receive special attention here.

If we consider the first element of communicating orthodox belief – providing instruction –, we could ask why it should be necessary to preach Marian doctrine to fellow schoolmen. Had not the Councils of Constantinople in 381 and 553 already clearly defined that Mary was *semper virgo*, always virgin, before and after giving birth? However, in Alan's time, this was challenged by groups which Alan usually calls "some heretics" in his apologetic treatise.[52] Here, he also addresses the Jewish opinion against the Christian virginity dogma.[53]. Thus, the virginity dogma was contested by groups clearly marked as "others".

Furthermore, new questions about Mary arose in the 12th century. In the 1140s, Bernard of Clairvaux argued against Mary's Immaculate Conception – an idea saying that she had been conceived in her mother Anne without the original sin. Before, canons in Lyon had introduced a feast commemorating the Immaculate Conception. The final papal decision in favour of this dogma came only in 1854. The second question that received new attention in the 12th century was about Mary's assumption – had she been assumed in body and soul or her soul only? Here, "orthodox" answers had to be established. It was in

---

[51] Bird, "Construction of Orthodoxy"; Jessalynn L. Bird, "The Wheat and the Tares: Peter the Chanter's Circle and the Fama-Based Inquest Against Heresy and Criminal Sins, C. 1198–c. 1235," In *Proceedings of the Twelfth International Congress of Medieval Canon Law*, ed. Uta-Renate Blumenthal, Monumenta iuris canonici C/ 13 (Città del Vaticano : Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2008), 763-856.

[52] Alanus ab Insulis, *De fide catholica*, col. 322: *Dicunt etiam quidam haeretici, nec vere ipsum natum de Virgine, nec conceptum*. See also Kienzle, *Cistercians*, 193–94, (with note 89 on Alan) for further 'heretical' opinions on Mary.

[53] Alanus ab Insulis, *De fide catholica*, cap. XVI (*Quibus auctoritatibus muniti dicunt Christum non esse conceptum de Virgine*), col. 415: *Conantur etiam praedicti asserere Christum non esse conceptum de Virgine. Ait enim auctoritas: Rorate, coeli, desuper, et nubes pluant justum, aperiatur terra, et germinet Salvatorem (Isai. XLV). Quid per terram significatur, nisi Maria mater Christi? Quae est hujus terrae apertio, nisi Mariae defloratio? In Ezechiele etiam legitur, quod clausa porta aperietur principi (Ezech. XLIV). Quid per principem intelligitur, nisi Christus, filius Joseph? Et de ipso Christo, mater ejus ait: Ego et pater tuus dolentes quaerebamus te (Luc. II). Praeterea, quomodo potest aliqua concipere vel parere, nisi viro cognita? Ubi autem Christiani dicunt: Ecce virgo concipiet et pariet filium (Isai. VII), textus Hebraeus non habet virgo, sed potius abscondita, vel occulta.*

1950 that Pope Pius XII declared Mary's bodily assumption as dogmatic.[54]

The theologian and sermon specialist Jean Longère observed that the Paris masters of the 12th century devoted most of their attention to Mary's conception and virginity. They stressed the latter fact in their Marian sermons and discussed several theories about her conception. Most agreed that she had been conceived with the original sin, but was purified either once or twice.[55] Older theological research wanted to make Alan of Lille an early partisan of her immaculate conception and bodily assumption.[56] This view cannot be upheld. In his Marian commentary on the Song of Songs, probably deriving from his lectures on the biblical book, Alan clearly states that Mary was purified in the moment of Christ's conception.[57] Concerning Mary's assumption, Alan is in line with Pseudo-Hieronymus, the authority in this question, according to which nothing can be said in this matter safely.[58]

In his sermons, Alan comments on Marian doctrine on various occasions. For the feast of Annunciation, he combines statements on Mary's conception and her virginity. By comparing the *virgo* to *virga*, a popular word game, he states: "Just as the rod is used to correct excesses, so in the Virgin the sin is deleted."[59] The following shows that this sentence is a statement against the Immaculate Conception: If

---

[54] From a critical point of view towards teleological and ahistorical accounts of the history of Mariology: Elisabeth Gössmann, "Reflexionen zur mariologischen Dogmengeschichte," In *Maria – Abbild oder Vorbild? Zur Sozialgeschichte mittelalterlicher Marienverehrung*, eds. Hedwig Röckelein, Claudia Opitz and Dieter R. Bauer (Tübingen: Ed. Diskord, 1990), 19-36. From a traditional point of view: Walter Delius, *Geschichte der Marienverehrung* (München, Basel: Reinhardt, 1963), 173–77; Georg Söll, "Maria in der Geschichte von Theologie und Frömmigkeit," In *Handbuch der Marienkunde*, eds. Wolfgang Beinert and Heinrich Petri (Regensburg: Pustet, 1984), 96–114.

[55] Jean Longère, *Œuvres oratoires de maîtres parisiens au XIIe siècle: Étude historique et doctrinale. Vol. 1: Texte* (Paris: Études augustiniennes, 1975), 222–28. See also Marielle Lamy, "La doctrine mariale des maîtres parisiens au tournant des XIIe et XIIIe siècles," in *Notre-Dame de Paris, 1163–2013: Actes du colloque scientifique tenu au Collège des Bernardins, à Paris, du 12 au 15 décembre 2012*, ed. Cédric Giraud and Véronique Julerot (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013), 97-112.

[56] Palémon Glorieux, "Alain de Lille, docteur de l'assomption," In *Mélanges de science religieuse* 8 (1951), 5-18.

[57] Alanus ab Insulis, *Elucidatio in Cantica Canticorum*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210 (Paris, 1855), col. 61: *Ergo, dum esset rex Christus, videlicet me* [i.e. Mariam] *et alios regens, in accubito suo, id est in me, in qua erat non solum in mente per gratiam, verum etiam in ventre per humanam naturam, nardus mea dedit odorem suum, id est caro mea fragilis* […], *adventu Spiritus sancti mundata, fomite peccati exstincto, in ea dedit odorem suum.*

[58] Alanus ab Insulis, *Elucidatio in Cantica Canticorum*, col. 73–74: *Non enim statim post ascensionem Christi, assumpta est gloriosa Virgo;* [...]. *Sed si Mater Virgo resurrexerit et in carne in coelum ascenderit, vel quando resurrexerit vel ascenderit, incertum est. Ideo monet Christus filias Jerusalem, id est Ecclesias, quod de resurrectione gloriosae Virginis nunquam definiant, vel de ejusdem resurrectionis tempore, quod a patriarchis, prophetis et apostolis distinctum non est* […]. *O filiae Jerusalem, id est Ecclesiae, adjuro vos per capreas cervosque camporum, id est in hoc imitantes antiquos modernosque doctores, ne suscitetis neque evigilare faciatis dilectam meam, id est non firmiter asseratis tanquam ex auctoritatibus certum Virginem a mortis somno suscitatam vel excitatam; donec ipsa velit. Quasi dicat: Hoc reservatum est voluntati Virginis, quae divinae voluntati est consona, ut sciri velit se esse suscitatam.* About Pseudo-Hieronymus/Paschasius Radbertus, see Delius, *Geschichte der Marienverehrung*, 150–53; Gössmann, "Reflexionen," 30–32.

[59] Edited in Jean Longère, "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille († 1203) pour la fête de l'annonciation: Gloriosa dicta sunt de te, ciuitas Dei (Ps. 86, 3)," In *Fons lucis: Miscellanea di studi in onore di Ermanno M. Toniolo*, ed. Rosella Barbieri, Ignazio M. Calabuig and Ornella di Angelo, Scripta pontificiae facultatis theologicae Marianum 58 (Rom: Marianum, 2004), § 6, 405: *Sicut uirga excessus corriguntur, sic in Virgine peccatum deletur.*

Mary had been conceived without sin, it would not have been necessary that Christ ordered the angels to guard her from temptation. When Christ entered the "castle" Mary, he fought against sin, but he entered this castle through a golden door, since Mary was a virgin.[60]

A sermon on Mary's assumption starts with affirming her virginity: Christ had three weddings, the first of which was in the Virgin's uterus. Here, the bedroom was the secret chamber of the virgin hall. Mary was always virgin and an "immaculate" mother, meaning here that her motherhood was not caused by intercourse.[61] In all of his four sermons on Assumption, Alan is careful to avoid the impression that he spoke in favour of the bodily assumption. He speaks of her ascent in general terms, as in the comparison of Mary and the elevated plane tree of the Book of Sirach (Sir 24:19).[62]

As we can see, these statements are far from special. Why then did Alan include them? In general, I think, Alan regarded his hearers as potential spreaders of orthodoxy which he wanted to equip with suitable sermon texts and ideas.[63] Furthermore, Alan could provide future preachers with the right images and metaphors for complicated theological issues.[64] The greatest success in this sense was obtained by his preaching manual, the *Ars Praedicandi*, which is extant in over 140 manuscripts.[65] Other sermons were quoted by the chronicler Emo van Wittewierum,[66] by Stephen Langton,[67] or, extensively, by the Carthusian Hugues of Miramar.[68]

---

[60] Longère, "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille", § 7, 405–06: *Hec* [Maria] *est castrum, immo castellum,* […]. *Humana enim natura ante Christi Incarnationem angelice nature fuit contraria. In hoc castello erant asina et pullus ligati, id est sensualitas et sensualitatis motus primitiui, qui ex se non erant bono obnoxii, sed per angelorum custodiam ad bonum sunt soluti. Et postquam Christus per Incarnationem aduenit, asinam et pullum insedit, quia tam sensualitas quam primitiui eius motus ei obediuit. Christus hoc intrauit castellum, pugnaret contra diabolum, sed intrauit per auream portam, ianuis clausis, quia neque in ingressu neque in egressu fractum est in ea sigillum uirginitatis.*

[61] For this sermon on Ct 3,6 and its manuscript tradition, see d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 136. In my thesis, I discuss its authenticity and provide a critical edition. The following quote is from this edition, which closely follows London, BL, Add. 19767, fol. 90r–95r, here fol. 90r: *Miserator et misericors Dominus, longanimis et multum misericors pater familias numquam ociosus ad nostri reparationem tres nuptias filio suo celebrauit: Primas in utero Uirginis. Secundas in ecclesie gremio. Tercias in celesti solio* […]. *Primarum nuptiarum thalamus fuit secretarium aule uirginee* […]. *In primis nuptiis sancta Dei genitrix fuit uirgo perpetua et mater inmaculata.*

[62] In my thesis, I argue in favour of the authenticity of the sermon on Sir 24,19 *Quasi oliva speciosa in campis*, as it can be found in Paris, BNF, lat. 3818, fol. 41v: *Unde legitur: Aque sapientie et intellectus potauit eum. Hec uero platanus, id est uirgo sanctissima, exaltata fuit iuxta hanc aquam, id est diuinam sapientiam, quia preter Dei filium humanatum, qui est diuina sapientia, uirgo excellentior est omni creatura et haec habet ab ipsa sapientia et sic exaltata est iuxta aquam in plateis.* […] *In hiis plateis predictis modis platanus exaltatur, exaltata usque ad celos immo supra paradysi cedros. Hec que fuit uirgula deserti eleuatur supra cedros paradysi. De qua uirgula legitur in cantico amoris: Que est ista que ascendit per desertum sicut uirgula fumi.*

[63] See also Bird, "Construction of Orthodoxy."

[64] Cf. Bird, "Construction of Orthodoxy," 58.

[65] Francesco Siri provides a list of 128 manuscripts in Francesco Siri, "Et natura mediocritatis est amica: Empreintes philosophiques dans la prédication d'Alain de Lille," In *Revue des sciences philosophiques et théologiques* 97 (Paris: Vrin, 2013): 335–42. In my thesis, I added 17 more to that number.

[66] See d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 18.

[67] See Magdalena Bieniak, "Stefano Langton sulla volontà sensitiva in Cristo," In *Przegląd Tomistyczny/ The Thomistic Revue* 22 (Warsaw: Thomistic Institute, 2016), 55-72.

[68] As I found out, Hugues, in his *De hominis miseria, mundi et inferni contemptu*, makes heavy use of the sermon edited by Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny, "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille sur la misère de l'homme," In *Pensée médiévale en occident: Théologie, magie et autres textes des* XIIᵉ–XIIIᵉ *siècles*, ed. Charles Burnett, Variorum Collected Studies Series 511 (Aldershot: Variorum, 1995), 515–35.

But there is one more dimension of his religious teaching: one which is connected to the still insecure situation of the Paris masters as theologians. Bearing in mind the precarious situation of independent masters in a time when the schools became more and more numerous, it is likely that his explanations served to strengthen the identity of the masters as representatives of orthodoxy.[69] By repeating the 'correct' or the least suspicious doctrines among peers, the group members could practice their self-fashioning as orthodox teachers.

This reading is supported by the fact that Alan advocated the masters' expert role in theology on several occasions. In his preaching manual, the *Ars Praedicandi*, he postulated an intellectual ascent, involving the study and teaching of theology, as necessary for preaching.[70] In his sermons, he distinguished the respective fields of monks and scholars, as the masters Peter Comestor and Hilduin at Notre Dame did before him:[71] The monks' task is to pray for humankind.[72] The masters of the schools are responsible for doing theology.[73] This way, Alan contributed to the social cohesion of the otherwise fluid groups of masters and students.

---

[69] For the time around 1200, Nathalie Gorochov finds an increasing fear of heresy among the Paris masters and even advances the thesis that this fear might have contributed to the formation of the university, see Gorochov, *Naissance de l'université*, 160: "N'est-ce pas la lutte anti-hérétique qui incite alors les théologiens parisiens, à se donner les moyens de contrôler étroitement l'enseignement d'éventuels maîtres dissidents au sein des écoles de la capitale capétienne? Le présent chapitre propose un retour sur ce contexte religieux qui semble avoir pesé d'un grand poids dans la genèse de l'université, une institution capable de fédérer et de contrôler les maîtres."

[70] Alanus ab Insulis, *Ars Praedicandi*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210 (Paris, 1855), col. 111: *Vidit scalam Jacob a terra usque ad coelum attingentem, per quam ascendebant et descendebant angeli (Gen. XXVIII). Scala est profectus viri catholici, qui congeritur ab initio fidei, usque ad consummationem viri perfecti. In hac scala primus gradus est, confessio; secundus, oratio; tertius, gratiarum actio; quartus, Scripturarum perscrutatio; quintus, si aliqui occurrat dubium in Scriptura, a majore inquisitio; sextus, Scripturae expositio; septimus, praedicatio.*

[71] See Petrus Comestor, *Sermones*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 198 (Paris, 1855), col. 1747: *Sane, sicut sunt duo rami contemplationis, lectio, scilicet, et oratio, in quibus tota meditatio contemplantis versatur: ita sunt qui orationi magis operam dantes lectioni minus insistunt, et hi sunt claustrales. Sunt alii qui lectioni invigilant, rarius orantes, et hi sunt scholares.* Cf. also Hilduins statement, as quoted by Jean Longère, *Œuvres oratoires de maîtres parisiens au XIIe siècle: Étude historique et doctrinale. Vol. 2: Notes* (Paris: Études augustiniennes, 1975), 292: *Sunt autem duo genera contemplatiuorum: alii sunt claustrales, alii sunt scolares. Claustrales vacant orationi, scolares vero lectioni.*

[72] In the sermon on Ps 24(25),1 *Ad te levavi animam meam*, see d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 127. Dijon, BM, 219, fol. 85vb–86ra: *Vos ergo claustrales, qui ad Dominum animam leuastis, qui cum Iob animam suspendistis, qui cum Moyse in monte contemplationis cum Deo colloquium habetis, surrigite ad Deum manus bonorum operum eleuatas, orantes pro Israhelitis pugnantibus contra Amalechitas, id est pro nobis dimicantibus contra demonum insidias.* On this motive see Thierry Kouamé, "*Monachus non doctoris, sed plangentis habet officium*: L'autorité de Jérôme dans le débat sur l'enseignement des moines aux XIe et XIIe siècles," In *Le système d'enseignement occidental (XIe– XVIe siècle)*, ed. Thierry Kouamé, Cahiers de recherches médiévales 18 (Paris: Honoré Champion, 2009), 9-38.

[73] In a sermon on the dedication of a church about Mt 21,13 *Scriptum est enim, quod domus mea domus orationis*, Alan distinguishes four 'houses of prayer' in the typical scholastic manner. The first *domus* is the Church, where there is the 'school of discipline'. The monastery is such a house, because the practices there pray to God: ascetic practices and prayers by word and mind. The third exegesis of *domus orationis* says that it can be understood as 'sacra scriptura' – a term that can designate the Bible as well as theology in Alan's time. In any case, he states that he (as a master) and his scholarly audience fight for the first (the Church), adore the second (Christ's human nature), scrutinize the third, i.e. the *sacra scriptura*, and merit to reach the fourth *domus*, which is eternal life. He thereby claims doing theology for his group. See the sermon text in Toulouse, BM, 195, fol. 105v–106r: *Specialiter etiam cenobium siue conuentus fidelium claustralium dicitur domus orationis. Ibi enim orat ad Deum deiectio habitus, asperitas uictus, silentium oris, silentium cordis, ieiunium carnis a cibo, ieiunium mentis a peccato, vigilia oculi, vigilia animi,*

The second strategy to foster orthodoxy according to Jessalynn Bird was to promote self-inquiry. The Paris masters designed manuals for confession to help confessors scrutinize the minds and consciences of their penitents. Thereby, they could both discover deviant thought and implement orthodox doctrine.[74] In the time between Peter Lombard and the later university masters such as Alexander of Hales, it was still contested whether remission from sins, be they interior sins or sins of deed, required oral confession with a priest. In general, the schoolmen of that time instilled a new urge to scrutinize one's inner self, as Susan Kramer argues.[75] Alan clearly subscribed to this agenda and authored a confessor's manual.[76]

However, Alan did not only focus on confessors and lay persons, but also had his fellow schoolmen in mind, as carriers and disseminators of 'orthodoxy'. Confession and self-inquiry are meant to ensure the scholars' conformity with approved doctrine. Alan belonged to those preachers calling for contrition, confession, and satisfaction.[77] He argued for priestly confession as a necessary step in reconciliation. A good example is his sermon for Ash Wednesday about the Book of Sirach 7,40, *Memorare novissima tua.* His audience, the scholars, are constantly admonished to "know themselves". Pitiless searching for one's own failures leads to acknowledging the need for pastoral care. Here, contrition is only achieved after confession, which is followed by satisfaction.[78] His words echo passages in a model sermon of Alan's preaching manual, where confession is treated as obligatory as well.[79] In other sermons and in Alan's penitential manual, the three steps are contrition, confession, and satisfaction.[80] The role of the priest or – in Alan's context – the role of theology masters with priestly consecration is defined as a means of discipline. The scholars themselves are subjected to control via the confessional. The practice of confession could both help discover deviant thoughts and avoid deviant thinking beforehand, in a sort of self-censorship.

---

oratio uocalis, oratio mentalis. […] (fol. 106r) *Sacra etiam scriptura dicitur domus orationis*. […] *Nos ergo in prima domo orationis militantes, secundam adorantes, terciam perscrutantes, ad quartam peruenire mereamur*. The sermon is listed in d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 137–38.

[74] Cf. Bird, "Construction of Orthodoxy," 51–53.

[75] Susan R. Kramer, "The Priest in the House of Conscience: Sins of Thought and the Twelfth-Century Schoolmen," In *Viator* 37 (2006), 149-66.

[76] Alanus ab Insulis, *Liber Poenitentialis: Vol. 2*.

[77] These steps of penance were increasingly discussed among the Paris masters of the 12th century, cf. Kramer, "The Priest", and on Alan cf. Jean Longère, "Théologie et pastorale de la pénitence chez Alain de Lille," In *Cîteaux* 30 (1979), 149-66; Jean Longère, "Alain de Lille, théologien de la pénitence," In *Alain de Lille, Gautier de Châtillon, Jakemart Giélée et leur temps*, ed. Henri Roussel (Lille: Presses Univ. de Lille, 1980), 101-12.

[78] Alanus ab Insulis. Sermon on Sir 7,40, edited in: d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 267–73, 273: *Sed iam hoc dele* [i. e. delete from the 'book of conscience'] *per confessionem quod scripsisti per falsam loqutionem, dele per contritionem quod scripsisti per malam cogitationem; dele per satisfactionem quod scripsisti per prauam operationem* […]. *Per confessionem hunc librum* [i. e. the *liber conscientiae*] *aperi, ne aperiatur in die iudicii, quando aperientur libri conscientiarum. Reuela peccatum, ne reueletur; accusa delictum, ne accusetur*.

[79] Alanus ab Insulis, *Ars Praedicandi*, cap. 31, col. 172: *Per quod demonstratur, quod poenitens curatus a spirituali lepra per contritionem, tenetur se ostendere sacerdoti per confessionem. Tu ergo, confitere peccata ut absoluaris, accusa ut excuseris. Si in praesenti non es accusator tui, tres habebis accusatores in die judicii: Deum accusatorem et judicem, conscientiam accusantem et punientem, daemonem accusantem et punitorem*.

[80] Cf. the 'Sermo de clericis ad theologiam non accedentibus', edited in d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 274–78, 278; Alanus ab Insulis, *Liber Poenitentialis: Vol. 2*, IV, 3, p. 163: *Ad hoc autem ut vera sit confessio, necessaria tria concurrunt: cordis contritio, oris confessio, non relabendi intentio vel operis satisfactio*.

Furthermore, Alan admonishes his listeners to "know themselves". He does so in at least 10% of his sermons, most of them Lenten sermons.[81] In his time, Lenten preaching became more and more frequent, sometimes occurring even daily during the Lenten period.[82] The so-called Christian socratism, condensed in the phrase "Know thyself",[83] is one of his major topics, and means to acknowledge both one's sinful state and one's likeness to God. To know one's sinful state means to reflect upon committed vices, such as the typical scholastic vices of pride and excess (*superbia* and *luxuria*).[84] But, what is even more important, self-knowledge is a prerequisite for the knowledge of God, according to Alan. In a sermon on Ijob 14,1, he states that via self-knowledge, one is able to restore one's likeness to God and thereby to regain the abilities to know God.[85] In the sermon for Ash Wednesday on Sirach 7,40, he equates self-knowledge with a certain state of mind that is associated with higher knowledge of God: The person becomes a "human being-spirit" (*homo spiritus*).[86] Self-knowledge, thus, becomes central for doing 'orthodox' theology.

Conclusion

To sum up, we can see that Alan's preaching shows the elements of promoting orthodoxy, as defined by Jessalynn Bird: instruction and

[81] For a preliminary study on this topic, see Anne Greule, "Curiositas und Wissbegier im Predigtœuvre des Alain von Lille," In *Curiositas*, ed. Andreas Speer and Robert M. Schneider, Miscellanea Mediaevalia 42 (Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter, 2022), 267-91.

[82] Cf. Jean Longère, "Fastenpredigten," *Lexikon des Mittelalters* 4 (1989). coll. 310-12; Pietro Delcorno, Eleonora Lombardo, and Lorenza Tromboni, "Introduzione: I sermoni quaresimali. Digiuno del corpo, banchetto dell'anima," In *I sermoni quaresimali. Digiuno del corpo, banchetto dell'anima*, eds. Pietro Delcorno, Eleonora Lombardo and Lorenza Tromboni, Memorie domenicane 48 (Firenze: Nerbini, 2017), 9-15.

[83] Cf. Pierre Courcelle, *Connais-toi toi-même*: *De Socrate à Saint Bernard,* 3 vols. (Paris: Études Augustiennes, 1974–1975).

[84] For these "scholastic' vices", cf. Antoine Destemberg, *L'honneur des universitaires au Moyen Âge*: *Étude d'imaginaire social,* Le nœud gordien (Paris: Presses Univ. de France, 2015), 64–74.

[85] Through sin, humankind has lost the *gratuita* and *naturalia* of God, which made them *ad Dei similitudinem* and *ad eius imaginem*, and thereby they also lost their ability to know God. But by pitiless self-examination and self-knowledge brings both back and thus also allows for the knowledge of God. See Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Ijob 14,1*, edited in: d'Alverny, "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille sur la misère de l'homme", 530–534: *O homo, creatus eras ad Dei similitudinem in gratia, ad eius imaginem in natura; sed iam deleta similitudine, pertransis in sola imagine, nec imagine vera, sed imaginis umbra, quia non tantummodo gratuita respuis, verum vite etiam naturalia euacuas et extinguis. O homo, ubi intellectus tuus, quo intelligere debes quis te fecit, de quo fecit, qualem fecit, ad quid fecit? […] O homo, quomodo amisisti tuum intellectum quo scrutari debes Scripture abyssum, diuidens a spiritu litteram, a nucleo testam, […]? Ubi rationis ventilabrum, quo diuidatur verum a falso, iustum ab iniusto, caducum ab eterno, ut istud fugias, illud appetas, […]? Ubi memoria que intellectum thesaurizet, que laudabiliora armario recordationis commendet? […] Sed ad te, homo, reuertere, te cognosce, tuam mentem ingredere, conscientiam discute, mala ab animo excute; quia homo es, te considera; quia natus de muliere, te humilia; quia breui viuens tempore, breuitatem vite longanimitate compensa; […] et quia egrederis ut flos, fructum redde; et quia aduersitatibus extra contereris, intus animum per penitentiam contere. noli ut umbra illum fugere, quem non potes effugere; sed ad ipsum accede per bonorum naturalium usum, ut eius vera fias imago; per gratuitorum fructum, ut eius sis similitudo; per perseuerantiam bonorum <operum>, ut eius sis signaculum.*

[86] See Alanus ab Insulis. Sermon on Sir 7,40, edited in: d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 267–73, 271: *Est homo qui querit se intra se, qui suam vitam legit, suam miseriam intelligit, suam culpam agnoscit, preteritum dolet, futurum timet. Qui querit se supra se fit diabolus, qui querit se iuxta se phariseus, qui querit se infra se fit homo pecus; qui querit se intra se fit homo spiritus.* The idea of the *homo spiritus* is part of Alan's knowledge system that links this state to the angelic knowledge of God, see Giulio D'Onofrio, "Alano di Lilla e la teologia," In *Alain de Lille, le docteur universel: Philosophie, théologie et littérature au XIIᵉ siècle*, eds. Jean-Luc Solère, Anca Vasiliu and Alain Galonnier, Rencontres de philosophie médiévale 12 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2005), 289–337.

promotion of self-inquiry. Alan spoke to his fellow schoolmen about Marian doctrines in a rather traditional way, avoiding potentially suspicious statements. He urged them to make confession to a priest, to "know themselves" and to scrutinize their consciences regularly. He even stated a causal connection between self-knowledge and the knowledge of God, thereby linking 'orthodoxy' to the successful inquiry of the self.

Clare Monagle's work helps us to see these elements in the context of the "Scholastic Project". This project excluded those persons which were considered as standing outside of the established lines of orthodoxy as defined by the men of the schools. At the same time, these men did not all speak from a hegemonic position. The second half of the 12th century was the time when the schools grew, and the masters partly started to cooperate. It was only in the 13th century that the university of Paris, as a new institution, came into being and gradually acquired its status as a religious authority. Before, the independent masters in particular had to find ways to establish themselves as experts in questions of faith and religion.

Taking the example of Alan of Lille, I tried to show how the masters of Paris aimed to present themselves as orthodox teachers and to subject themselves under the control of the confessor and their own conscience. Alan's statements on doctrine to peers served as a means of orthodox self-fashioning in a time of transition in the history of the Paris schools. Utterances formerly seen as insignificant and common thereby acquire new meaning.

Further research could investigate how the theological views of the Paris masters in the 12th century – and one should clearly distinguish between the independent masters, the masters of the Cathedral school, and of St. Victor or monastic schools – potentially relate to the papal schism of that time, as Alexander III was supported by the French king Louis VII. It could be further asked if topics that are important for popular piety, such as the veneration of Mary, were treated differently than academic subtleties, assuming that topics with wider relevance better served the purpose of authority building.

On a more abstract level, research on the blurred boundaries between orthodoxy and heterodoxy, as concepts established by contemporaries, could profit from the view adopted here: That seemingly hegemonic positions can be associated or even caused by insecure status and internal dynamics.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Alanus ab Insulis. *Ars Praedicandi*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210. Paris, 1855, coll. 109–198.

Alanus ab Insulis. *De Fide Catholica Contra Haereticos*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210. Paris, 1855, coll. 305–430.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Distinctiones Dictionum Theologicalium*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210. Paris, 1855, coll. 685–1011.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Elucidatio in Cantica Canticorum*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 210. Paris, 1855, coll. 51–110.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Liber Poenitentialis: Vol. 1: Introduction doctrinale et littéraire*. Edited by Jean Longère. Analecta mediaevalia Namurcensia 17. Louvain, Lille: Éditions Nauwelaerts, 1965.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Liber Poenitentialis: Vol. 2: La tradition longue, texte inédit*. Edited by Jean Longère. Analecta mediaevalia Namurcensia 18. Louvain, Lille: Éditions Nauwelaerts, 1965.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Ct 3,6*. In: London, BL, Add. 19767, fol. 90r–95r.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Ijob 14,1*. Edited in: d'Alverny, "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille sur la misère de l'homme", 525–535.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Mt 21,13*. In: Toulouse, BM, 195, fol. 104v–106r.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Ps 24(25),1*. In: Dijon, BM, 219, fol. 84v–86r.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Sir 7,40*. Edited in: d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 267–73.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Sir 24,19*. In: Paris, BNF, lat. 3818, fol. 40r–41v.

Alanus ab Insulis. *Sermon on Thr 1,12*. Edited in: d'Alverny, *Alain de Lille*, 274–78.

Godfrey of St. Victor, *Le Microcosme (L'œuvre de Godefroid de Saint-Victor, vol. 1)*. Edited by Françoise Gasparri, Sous la Règle de Saint Augustin, 16. Turnhout: Brepols, 2020.

Petrus Comestor. *Sermones*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 198. Paris, 1855, coll. 1721–1844.

Petrus Pictaviensis. *Sententiae*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina 211. Paris, 1855, coll. 783–1280.

Secondary Sources

Alverny, Marie-Thérèse d'. *Alain de Lille: Textes inédits, avec une introduction sur sa vie et ses œuvres.* Études de philosophie médiévale 52. Paris: Vrin, 1965.

Alverny, Marie-Thérèse d'. "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille sur la misère de l'homme." In *Pensée médiévale en occident: Théologie, magie et autres textes des XIIᵉ-XIIIᵉ siècles,* ed. Charles Burnett, 515–35. Variorum Collected Studies Series 511. Aldershot: Variorum, 1995, 515–35.

Andrée, Alexander. "*Sacra Pagina*: Theology and the Bible from the School of Laon to the School of Paris." In *A Companion to Twelfth-Century Schools*, ed. Cédric Giraud, Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition 88. Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2020, 272–314.

Bain, Emmanuel. "Les hérétiques du prince: Alain de Lille et les hérétiques méridionaux." In *Le »Catharisme« en questions,* ed. Jean-Louis Biget, Cahiers de Fanjeaux 55. Fanjeaux, 2020, 173–96.

Baldwin, John W. *Masters, Princes and Merchants: The Social Views of Peter the Chanter and His Circle.* 2 vols. Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press, 1970.

Baldwin, John W. "Masters at Paris from 1179 to 1215: A Social Perspective." In *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, eds. Robert L. Benson, Giles Constable and Carol D. Lanham, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982, 138–72.

Baldwin, John W. *The Government of Philip Augustus: Foundations of French Royal Power in the Middle Ages.* Berkeley, Calif.: Univ. of California Press, 1986.

Benson, Robert Louis, Giles Constable, and Carol Dana Lanham, eds. *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982.

Bériou, Nicole. *L'avènement des maîtres de la parole: La prédication à Paris au XIIIᵉ siècle. Vol. 1.* Collection des études Augustiniennes. Moyen âge et temps modernes 31. Paris: Inst. d'Études Augustiniennes, 1998.

Bieniak, Magdalena. "Stefano Langton sulla volontà sensitiva in Cristo." *Przegląd Tomistyczny/ The Thomistic Revue* 22, 2016, 55–72.

Biller, Peter. "Northern Cathars and Higher Learning." In *The Medieval Church: Universities, Heresy, and the Religious Life. Essays in Honour of Gordon Leff*, ed. Peter Biller and Richard B. Dobson, Studies in Church History. Subsidia 11. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1999, 25–53.

Bird, Jessalynn L. "The Construction of Orthodoxy and the (De)Construction of Heretical Attacks on the Eucharist in Pastoralia from Peter the Chanter's Circle in Paris." In *Texts and the Repression of Medieval Heresy*, eds. Caterina Bruschi and Peter Biller, York Studies in Medieval Theology 4. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2003, 45–61.

Bird, Jessalynn L. "The Wheat and the Tares: Peter the Chanter's Circle and the Fama-Based Inquest Against Heresy and Criminal Sins, C. 1198–c. 1235." In *Proceedings of the Twelfth International*

Congress of Medieval Canon Law, ed. Uta-Renate Blumenthal. Monumenta iuris canonici C/ 13. Città del Vaticano : Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 2008, 763–856.

Chiu, Hilbert. "Alan of Lille's Academic Concept of the Manichee." *Journal of Religious History* 35, no. 4 (2011): 492–506.

Clark, Mark J. "Peter Lombard, Stephen Langton, and the School of Paris: The Making of the Twelfth-Century Scholastic Biblical Tradition." In *Traditio* 72 (2017), 171–274.

Crossnoe, Marshall E. "The Regular Canons of Saint-Victor in the World of Louis VII." In *Louis VII and His World*, ed. Michael L. Bardot and Laurence W. Marvin, Later Medieval Europe 18. Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2018, 126–145.

Courcelle, Pierre. *Connais-toi toi-même: De Socrate à Saint Bernard.* 3 vols. Paris: Études Augustiennes, 1974–1975.

Deane, Jennifer Kolpacoff and Anne Elisabeth Lester, *"Introduction: Religion and Religious Worlds in Between."* In *Between Orders and Heresy: Rethinking Medieval Religious Movements*, eds. Jennifer K. Deane and Anne E. Lester. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2022, 3–22.

Delcorno, Pietro, Eleonora Lombardo, and Lorenza Tromboni. "Introduzione: I sermoni quaresimali. Digiuno del corpo, banchetto dell'anima." In *I sermoni quaresimali. Digiuno del corpo, banchetto dell'anima*, eds. Pietro Delcorno, Eleonora Lombardo and Lorenza Tromboni, Memorie domenicane 48. Firenze: Nerbini, 2017, 9–15.

Delius, Walter. *Geschichte der Marienverehrung*. München, Basel: Reinhardt, 1963.

Destemberg, Antoine. *L'honneur des universitaires au Moyen Âge: Étude d'imaginaire social.* Le nœud gordien. Paris: Presses Univ. de France, 2015.

Dinzelbacher, Peter. *Structures and Origins of the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance".* Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters 63. Stuttgart: Anton Hiersemann, 2017.

D'Onofrio, Giulio. "Alano di Lilla e la teologia," In *Alain de Lille, le docteur universel: Philosophie, théologie et littérature au XIIᵉ siècle*, eds. Jean-Luc Solère, Anca Vasiliu and Alain Galonnier, Rencontres de philosophie médiévale 12. Turnhout: Brepols, 2005, 289–337.

Doyle, Matthew. *Peter Lombard and his Students*, Studies and Texts 201 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2016).

Ferruolo, Stephen C. *The Origins of the University: The Schools of Paris and Their Critics, 1100–1215*. Stanford, Calif.: Univ. Press, 1985.

Gabriel, Astrik Ladislas. "The Cathedral Schools of Notre-Dame and the Beginning of the University of Paris." In *Garlandia. Studies in the History of the Mediaeval University* (Notre Dame, Ind.: The Mediaeval Inst., Univ. of Notre Dame; Frankfurt a.M.: Knecht, 1969), 39–64.

Giraud, Cédric. "L'école de Saint-Victor dans la première moitié du XIIᵉ siècle, entre école monastique et école cathédrale," In *L'école de*

Saint-Victor de Paris. Influence et rayonnement, ed. Dominique Poirel, Bibliotheca victorina 22 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2010), 101–119.

Giraud, Cédric, ed. *A Companion to Twelfth-Century Schools.* Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition 88. Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2020.

Glorieux, Palémon. "Alain de Lille, docteur de l'assomption." In *Mélanges de science religieuse* 8, 1951, 5–18.

Glorieux, Palémon. "Le 'Contra quatuor labyrinthos Franciae' de Gauthier de Saint-Victor." In *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Âge* 19 (1952) 187–335.

Gorochov, Nathalie. *Naissance de l'université: Les écoles de Paris d'Innocent III à Thomas d'Aquin (v. 1200–v. 1245)*. Études d'histoire médiévale 14. Paris: Champion, 2012.

Gössmann, Elisabeth. "Reflexionen zur mariologischen Dogmengeschichte." In *Maria - Abbild oder Vorbild? Zur Sozialgeschichte mittelalterlicher Marienverehrung*, eds. Hedwig Röckelein, Claudia Opitz and Dieter R. Bauer, Tübingen: Ed. Diskord, 1990, 19–36.

Greule, Anne. "Curiositas und Wissbegier im Predigtœuvre des Alain von Lille." In *Curiositas*, eds. Andreas Speer and Robert M. Schneider, Miscellanea Mediaevalia 42. Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter, 2022, 267–91.

Greule, Anne. "Prediger der Transformation: Alain von Lille und die Pariser Schulen in der zweiten Hälfte des 12. Jahrhunderts." Dissertation: Jena, 2022.

Große, Rolf. "Entre cour et cloître: Saint-Victor et les Capétiens au XIIe siècle." In *L'École de Saint-Victor de Paris. Influence et rayonnement*, ed. Dominique Poirel, Bibliotheca victorina 22. Turnhout: Brepols, 2010, 79–100.

Häring, Nikolaus M. "Alan of Lille's De Fide Catholica or Contra Haereticos." *Analecta Cisterciensia* 32, 1976, 216–37.

Hosler, John D. "The War Councils and Military Advisers of Louis VII of France," In *Louis VII and His World*, ed. Michael L. Bardot and Laurence W. Marvin, Later Medieval Europe 18 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2018), 11–28.

Jaeger, Charles Stephen. "Pessimism in the Twelfth-Century "Renaissance"." In *Speculum* 78, no. 4 (2003), 1151–83.

Kienzle, Beverly Mayne. *Cistercians, Heresy and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229: Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard*. York: York Medieval Press, 2001.

Kouamé, Thierry. "*Monachus non doctoris, sed plangentis habet officium*: L'autorité de Jérôme dans le débat sur l'enseignement des moines aux XIe et XIIe siècles." In *Le système d'enseignement occidental (XIe–XVIe siècle)*, ed. Thierry Kouamé, Cahiers de recherches médiévales 18. Paris, 2009, 9–38.

Kouamé, Thierry. "L'école cathédrale," In *Notre-Dame de Paris. Une cathédrale dans la ville. Des origines à nos jours*, eds. Boris Bove and Claude Gauvard (Paris: Belin, 2022), 163–187.

Kramer, Susan R. "The Priest in the House of Conscience: Sins of Thought and the Twelfth-Century Schoolmen." *Viator* 37 (2006), 149–66.

Lamy, Marielle. "La doctrine mariale des maîtres parisiens au tournant des XIIᵉ et XIIIᵉ siècles." In *Notre-Dame de Paris, 1163–2013: Actes du colloque scientifique tenu au Collège des Bernardins, à Paris, du 12 au 15 décembre 2012*, eds. Cédric Giraud and Véronique Julerot, Turnhout: Brepols, 2013, 97–112.

Longère, Jean. *Œuvres oratoires de maîtres parisiens au XIIᵉ siècle: Étude historique et doctrinale. Vol. 1: Texte*. Paris: Études augustiniennes, 1975.

Longère, Jean. *Œuvres oratoires de maîtres parisiens au XIIᵉ siècle: Étude historique et doctrinale. Vol. 2: Notes*. Paris: Études augustiniennes, 1975.

Longère, Jean. "Théologie et pastorale de la pénitence chez Alain de Lille." In *Cîteaux* 30 (1979), 125–88.

Longère, Jean. "Alain de Lille, théologien de la pénitence." In *Alain de Lille, Gautier de Châtillon, Jakemart Giélée et leur temps*, ed. Henri Roussel, Lille: Presses Univ. de Lille, 1980, 101-12.

Longère, Jean. "Fastenpredigten." *Lexicon des Mittelalters* 4 (1989), 310–12.

Longère, Jean. "Alain de Lille, prédicateur." In *Les sermons au temps de la Renaissance*, ed. Marie T. Jones-Davies, Université de Paris-Sorbonne, Société Internationale de Recherches Interdisciplinaires sur la Renaissance, SIRIR 24. Paris: Klincksieck, 1999, 125–42.

Longère, Jean. "Un sermon d'Alain de Lille († 1203) pour la fête de l'annonciation: Gloriosa dicta sunt de te, ciuitas Dei (Ps. 86, 3)." In *Fons lucis: Miscellanea di studi in onore di Ermanno M. Toniolo*, eds. Rosella Barbieri, Ignazio M. Calabuig and Ornella di Angelo, Scripta Pontificiae facultatis theologicae Marianum 58. Rom: Marianum, 2004, 393–408.

Monagle, Clare. *Orthodoxy and Controversy in Twelfth-Century Religious Discourse. Peter Lombard's 'Sentences' and the Development of Theology*, Europa sacra 8. Turnhout: Brepols, 2013.

Monagle, Clare. *The Scholastic Project.* Past imperfect series. Kalamazoo: Arc Humanities Press, 2017.

Moore, Robert I. *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Authority and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250*. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, ²2007.

Muessig, Carolyn, ed. *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages.* A New History of the Sermon 3. Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2002.

Nieto-Isabel, Delfi I., *"Introduction. All but Marginal: The Co-Constructions of Otherness in the Middle Ages."* In *Living on the Edge. Transgression, Exclusion, and Persecution in the Middle Ages*, eds. Delfi I. Nieto-Isabel and Laura Miquel Milian. Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter, 2022, 3–19.

Pearson, Joseph H. "The Anti-Jewish Polemic of Alan of Lille." In *Alain de Lille, le docteur universel: Philosophie, théologie et littérature au XIIᵉ siècle*, eds. Jean-Luc Solère, Anca Vasiliu and Alain

Galonnier, Rencontres de philosophie médiévale 12. Turnhout: Brepols, 2005, 83–106.

Rashdall, Hastings. *The Universities of Europe in the Middle Ages: Vol. 1*, eds. Frederick M. Powicke and Alfred B. Emden. Oxford, 1936.

Raynaud de Lage, Guy. *Alain de Lille: Poète du XIIᵉ siècle*. Montreal, Paris: Institut d'Études Médiévales, 1951.

Rexroth, Frank. *Fröhliche Scholastik: Die Wissenschaftsrevolution des Mittelalters*. München: C.H.Beck, 2018.

published in English: *Knowledge True and Useful: A Cultural History of Early Scholasticism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2023).

Rexroth, Frank. "Reformen gegen den Eigensinn: Die Pariser Statuten 1215 und der Konservatismus der frühen Universitätsgeschichte." In *Universität - Reform: Ein Spannungsverhältnis von langer Dauer (12.–21. Jahrhundert)*, ed. Stefan Hynek et al., Veröffentlichungen der Gesellschaft für Universitäts- und Wissenschaftsgeschichte 14. Basel: Schwabe Verlag Basel, 2018, 23–50.

Rexroth, Frank, and Teresa Schröder-Stapper, eds. *Experten, Wissen, Symbole: Performanz und Medialität vormoderner Wissenskulturen.* Historische Zeitschrift. Beiheft 71. Berlin, Boston, 2018.

Siri, Francesco. "Et natura mediocritatis est amica: Empreintes philosophiques dans la prédication d'Alain de Lille." In *Revue des sciences philosophiques et théologiques* 97, 2013, 299–343.

Siri, Francesco. "*Lectio, disputatio, reportatio*: Note su alcune pratiche didattiche nel XII secolo e sulla loro trasmissione." In *Medioevo e filosofia: Per Alfonso Maierù*, eds. Massimiliano Lenzi, Cesare A. Musatti and Luisa Valente, I libri di Viella 150. Rom, 2013. 109–28.

Söll, Georg. "Maria in der Geschichte von Theologie und Frömmigkeit." In *Handbuch der Marienkunde,* eds. Wolfgang Beinert and Heinrich Petri, Regensburg: Pustet, 1984, 93–231.

Steckel, Sita. *Kulturen des Lehrens im Früh- und Hochmittelalter: Autorität, Wissenskonzepte und Netzwerke von Gelehrten.* Norm und Struktur 39. Köln: Böhlau, 2011.

Trout, John M. "Alan the Missionary." *Cîteaux* 26, no. 3, 1975, 146–54.

Verger, Jacques. "Des écoles à l'université: la mutation institutionnelle." In *La France de Philippe Auguste*, ed. Robert-Henri Bautier, Colloques internationaux du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique 602. Paris, 1982, 817–46.

Verger, Jacques. "A propos de la naissance de l'université de Paris: Contexte social, enjeu politique, portée intellectuelle." In *Schulen und Studium im sozialen Wandel des hohen und späten Mittelalters*, ed. Johannes Fried, Vorträge und Forschungen 30. Sigmaringen: Thorbecke, 1986, 69–96.

Verger, Jacques. "De l'école d'Abélard aux premières universités." In *Pierre Abélard: Colloque International De Nantes,* eds. Jean Jolivet and Henri Habrias, Collection "Histoire". Rennes, 2003, 17–28.

Verger, Jacques. "Que sait-on des institutions universitaires parisiennes avant 1245?" In *Les débuts de l'enseignement universitaire à Paris (1200–1245 environ),* eds. Jacques Verger and Olga Weijers, Studia artistarum 38. Turnhout: Brepols, 2013, 27–47.

Walther, Helmut G. "St. Victor und die Schulen von Paris vor der Entstehung der Universität." In *Schule und Schüler im Mittelalter. Beiträge zur europäischen Bildungsgeschichte des 9. bis 15. Jahrhunderts*, ed. Martin Kintzinger, Archiv für Kulturgeschichte. Beihefte 42. Köln: Böhlau, 1996, 53–74.

Wei, Ian P. *Intellectual Culture in Medieval Paris: Theologians and the University, c. 1100–1330*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012.

Weijers, Olga. *A Scholar's Paradise: Teaching and Debating in Medieval Paris.* Studies on the Faculty of Arts 2. Turnhout: Brepols, 2015.

Weimar, Peter, ed. *Die Renaissance der Wissenschaften im 12. Jahrhundert.* Zürcher Hochschulforum 2. Zürich: Artemis-Verlag, 1981.

Winzer, Ulrich. *S. Gilles. Studien zum Rechtsstatus und Beziehungsnetz einer Abtei im Spiegel ihrer Memorialüberlieferung*. Münstersche Mittelalter-Schriften 59. München: Fink, 1988.